

V.—A Fragment of Menander Augmented and Located

L. A. POST

HAVERFORD COLLEGE

A new English translation of the Armenian version of Philo, *Questions and Answers on Genesis* (*Quaestionum et Solutionum eorum quae in Genesi sunt Sermones Quattuor*) is being prepared by Professor Ralph Marcus for the Loeb Classical Library. His exact rendering in English has brought to light a garbled version of fragment 581 (Kock) of Menander. Starting from this as a fixed point, it is possible to reconstruct the Greek of the preceding sentences so as to discover a hidden citation of Menander and the name of the play concerned, followed by about three new lines of the play. These lines evidently preceded fragment 581, which is thus augmented at the beginning and evidently comes from the play cited. From the translation it is not possible to be sure what this was in Greek, but I shall suggest that it was probably *Hypergêrôs*, *Superannuated*. Thus the opinion of a majority of editors, that fragment 581 does not belong to the *Epitrepontes*, is confirmed.

Let us take up first Aucher's Latin version of Philo, which is found in most editions of that author. On the verse Genesis 24:34, in which Abraham's eldest servant introduces himself with the words, "I am the slave of Abraham," Philo asks the question: *Quare vir ad senectutem vergens incipit sic (loqui): Puer Abrahæ sum ego*. In his answer he explains first the deeper meaning, namely that the relation of uttered discourse to the inner word of reason is as the relation of boy to man. Philo now proceeds to explain the literal meaning as follows:

Littera vero laudem continet eius, qui senilem aetatem transigebat: ubi enim alii declinant ad manifestandos sese ex generatione patriaque, iste ex domino (id facit), ipsum existimans tam patriam, quam progeniem. Hinc iter faciens dedit trium mensurarum hanc directionem: mihi, inquit, civitas est, refugium et lex, tam iusti quam iniusti cuiusque iudicator dominus; ad servum mentem oportet me degere.

With this let us compare the English version of Professor Marcus:

But the literal meaning gives the praise of him who is past old age. For whereas others make the error of declaring themselves to be of (such and such) a family or country, he (declares himself to be) of his lord, whom he considers his country and family. Setting out from there and going far off, he makes him expressly to be of three measures. "To me the lord is a city, a refuge and a law and a judge of every righteous and unrighteous man. It befits me to live with the servant mind."

This version affords a better basis than Aucher's for retranslation into Greek. Furthermore Marcus gives in a footnote some of the Greek: πόλις καὶ καταφυγή καὶ νόμος. Since these words are found in fragment 581 of Menander, which was assigned to the *Epitrepontes* (lines 36–38 Körte) by Jernstedt, it was easy to recall the fragment and to discover that the whole fragment of three lines was evidently cited by Philo. The last line was garbled in the Greek as the Armenian translation shows. The fragment will be quoted later.

The recognition of this fragment set me looking for a reference to Menander, whose name in Greek might easily be taken by a translator to be the two words μὲν ἀνδρός. Allowing for a little more misunderstanding and garbling, it requires no great insight to discover that the first sentence above may represent the Greek: τὸ δὲ ῥητὸν εὐλόγως ἀποδίδωσι Μένανδρος ἐν Ὑπεργήρῳ, "Menander renders the literal meaning eloquently in his *Superannuated Man* (or *Woman*)." While there is no evidence elsewhere that Menander or any other writer of comedy wrote a play with this title, it is obvious that a very old and helpless character would serve excellently to illustrate the loyalty of a good slave. Geta in the *Adelphoe* of Terence is a similarly good slave. Note lines 479–482:

hic Geta
praeterea, ut captus est servorum, non malus
neque iners: alit illas, solus omnem familiam
sustentat.

If it is admitted, as I think it must be, that the name of Menander stood in the original of our passage, it is very difficult to suppose that "him who is past old age" can represent anything but the title of the play of Menander that is quoted in the following lines. Even if Philo might conceivably refer to Abraham or to his servant in such terms, he could hardly quote Menander as doing so. A glance at Leisegang's index in the Cohn-Wendland edition of Philo (vol. 7, Berlin, De Gruyter, 1926) shows that Philo quoted Menander elsewhere in his work. There is room for a new title in the

list of Menander's plays, for he is said to have written one hundred five or more; and not so many titles are known. Alfred Körte in his article "Menander" in *RE* 15.1.718 listed only ninety-six.

To pass now to the following sentence, which presumably comprises a quotation from Menander, it is clear in spite of the translator's use of the third person that some speaker says that he makes himself known as of a certain master, though others declare themselves to be of a certain family and country. Evidently a slave is speaking and is pointing out that for a slave there are no ties of nation or family. In place of such ties he owes loyalty to his master. The same sentiment is found in fragment 265 of Antiphanes. He was either the poet of Middle Comedy and much older than Menander or a later poet of the same name contemporary with Menander:

δούλω γὰρ οἶμαι πατρίδος ἐστερημένω
χρηστὸς γενόμενός ἐστι δεσπότης πατρίς.

This sentiment is found also in Pliny *Ep.* 8.16.2: *servis res publica quaedam et quasi civitas domus est*. I owe this reference to W. L. Westermann. But it is no error when those who are not slaves identify themselves as belonging to a certain country or family. We must explain this expression in one of two ways. Either the translation may represent an ἀποκλίνονται that is a false reading of ἀποκρίνονται, and Aucher's *declinant* suggests that this is right, or there may have been in the original a reference to men traveling, for the Greek πλανῶμαι, like the Latin *erro*, means to roam or travel as well as to be in error.

On the assumption that the former of these explanations is correct I have produced three lines of Greek iambics that, however unworthy they may be of Menander, show what I conceive the form and sense of the original to have been. Let no one cavil at my neglect of Porson's law and of caesura, since such neglect is characteristic of Menander's verse. Demetrius informs us (*On Style* 4.195) that Menander wrote for actors, not for readers. His style is not smooth but highly dramatic. Words are displaced as in conversation for the sake of emphasis. Ellipsis and anacoluthon are common. At any rate here is my poor best:

ἄλλοι μὲν ἀποκρίνοντ' ἐπειπόντες γένους
τίνος εἰσὶ καὶ πατρίδος, ἐγὼ δὲ δεσπότης,
ὥς ὄντος ἀντὶ πατρίδος αὐτοῦ καὶ γένους.

I translate: "Others when answering (the question who they are) state also to what family and country they belong, but I add the name of my master, since he takes the place of country and family."

The custom of asking strangers for their names is amply illustrated in Greek literature. Herodotus (1.173) tells us that Lycians would give their pedigree in the female line. Philodemus mentions (*De Vitiis* 18.1 Jensen) the kind of man who refuses to answer when asked who he is. Both among Greeks and Romans a slave was legally distinguished only by his master's name, but in comedy slaves have proper names as well. For a full discussion of the Greek name including names of slaves with citation of literary and inscriptional evidence see Rudolf Hirzel, "Der Name, ein Beitrag zu seiner Geschichte im Altertum und besonders bei den Griechen," *Abh. sächs. Akad., phil.-hist. Kl.*, 63 (1921) 1-105.

It might be expected that some trace of the words or sentiment of this fragment would be found either in a late writer who knew his Menander, or in a Latin writer of comedy, or in a philosopher discussing the duties of a slave. Furthermore, commentators on Genesis, deriving explanations from Philo, may have reproduced this passage in some form. I have made some excursions in these fields but have found nothing to the point. On the other hand, it would be impossible to prove a negative in so large a field even if I had made a far more thorough search than I did make. Olympiodorus in a scholion on Plato, *Alcibiades I*, 120B informs us that in the old days free men differed from slaves both in their names and in their wearing of hair, but makes no further contribution. Such late writers as Alciphron seem not to be interested in slaves, however much they may follow New Comedy in other respects.

The third sentence of our passage yields its meaning as soon as we observe that "three measures" derives probably from a reference to trimeters. Philo in quoting uses the word *τρίμετρον* four times according to Leisegang's index. In Herodotus (1.5) we find the phrase *ἐς τὸ πρόσω τοῦ λόγου προβήσομαι*. The rest is easy: *ἐντέθεν προβαίνων εἰς τὸ πρόσω τῶν τριμέτρων ἐπιτηδείως ποιεῖ*, "going on with the trimeters from that point he fittingly says." This is an introduction to the already known fragment 581. If we ask why Philo inserts this comment, we shall reflect that he is either omitting some lines that intervened in Menander between the two fragments, or he desires by inserting his comment to give special emphasis to

the quotation that requires absolute loyalty of the slave. The Armenian of this passage lends itself particularly well to my interpretation, so much so that Professor Marcus has modified his version to accord.

We come now to the known fragment (581 Kock) of Menander, which I cite:

ἐμοὶ πόλις ἐστὶ καὶ καταφυγὴ καὶ νόμος
καὶ τοῦ δικαίου τοῦ τ' ἀδίκου παντὸς κριτῆς
ὁ δεσπότης. πρὸς τοῦτον ἕνα δεῖ ζῆν ἐμέ.

"My city and refuge and law and judge in every matter of right and wrong is my master. I must live to please him only." How "the servant mind" got into the Armenian version we can only guess. It looks as if the Armenian were translating *δούλου νοῦν* instead of *τοῦτον ἕνα*. At any rate we have here an example of the sort of error that we may expect to find in the Armenian translation of Philo. There may be corruption of the Greek text, of the Armenian text, or of both; and the translator may have made mistakes of all sorts in interpreting the Greek. With this warning I now append the Armenian text as supplied to me with a literal translation by Professor Marcus, for whose kind assistance I am most grateful. Except for the encouragement that he has given me, I should not have ventured to put my restoration of Philo and Menander before my readers. It will be seen that I have not been able to follow the Armenian word for word, though there can be little doubt that I am on the right track. The way is open for others to contribute corrections or additions to what I have done.

Armenian text with literal translation

Isk čard govout' iun oui zaynr or ančēal ēr zcerouni
But the literal(text) praise has of this (man) who having passed was¹ senile
hasakawn. K'anzi ayločn moloreloč zekoučanel zink'eans
age. For (whereas others)² are erring² in declaring themselves
yazgē ew i gawařē, sa i tearnēn, zsa hamareal
by race and by family this(man) by his lord³ (declares himself) that one⁴ considering

¹ I.e., has passed.

² Genitive plurals reflecting Greek genitive absolute.

³ ἐκ κυρίου αὐτοῦ.

⁴ ἐκείνον.

ew gawaṛ ew azg. Asti dēm edeal ew taradēm gnaṣeal yet (*v.l.*
 both family and race. Hence face setting⁵ and face setting⁶ later
 yetoy) zerek' ṣap'eans zays arar dēp oulil. Inṣ k'aḷak' ē
 in three-measures⁷ this he made rightly.⁸ To me city-state is
 apastan ew ōrenk' ew ardaroyṇ ew anirawin amenayni datōl
 refuge and law both of the just and of the unjust all judge
 tearṇ. aṛ caray mits part ē inṣ keal.
 the lord. With a servant mind⁹ proper it is for me to live.

⁵ I.e., setting out.

⁶ I.e., setting out (a synonym of preceding participial phrase).

⁷ Probably locative plural, i.e., *ἐν τριμέτροις*.

⁸ Adjective or adverb, *ὁρθῶς*.

⁹ Accusative or locative from *νοῦς*, *διάνοια* *vel sim.*